



# Moor Lane More Torah

A Monthly Publication From The Manchester Montefiore Community Kollel

Sponsored Leilu Nishmat Yehudah Ben Shmuel HaCohen Breslauer



By Rabbi Moshe Stamler Rabbinical Advisor, Moor Lane Shul

## Bread on Pesach?

The Torah states that the Bnei Yisrael 'baked the dough which they took out of Mitsraim into matsah cakes and not chamets because they were driven out of Mitsraim' before they had time to let the dough rise. The Hagaddah expands on this with the famous words of Rabban Gamliel – 'we eat this matsah because our fathers' dough did not have time to rise'. But it was the first day of פסח, and they had already been given the mitsvot of not eating or owning chamets, so they could not have let it rise anyway, even if they had had all the time they wanted! How can the passuk imply that they would have made bread? There are various answers to this question. Rabbeinu Nissim gives an answer based on the idea that in that year Pesach was different. In Pesachim 96b Rabbi Yossei Hagelili derives from the pesukim that in the year they left Mitsraim there was only one day of Pesach, the 15th of Nissan, the actual day they left. Now this in itself does not answer our question, but Rabbeinu Nissim adds a point which is not in the Gemara: that even on that one day, there was no restriction on owning chamets. So, had they been given time, they would have made chamets – not for eating that day – but for their journey. [See Tosafot Yom Tov who discusses the issue of baking on Yom Tov for the weekday.] Rabbi Yechezkel Landau

in the 'Tslach' contests this assertion of Rabbeinu Nissim that there was no restriction on owning chamets. He therefore modifies the approach of Rabbeinu Nissim by suggesting that the one day of Pesach in that year refers – not to the night and day of the 15th of Nissan – but to the day of the 14th of Nissan and the following night, encompassing the time of the shechita and eating of the Korban Pesach. When it comes to korbanot, the night follows the day, and Pesach that year was a 'day then night' chag. By the morning when they left, it was no longer Pesach! Others [Malbim et al] adopt the same approach, but based on the idea that before the giving of the Torah, we followed a 'day then night' time schedule for everything, not just korbanot. Rabbi Landau uses this approach to answer a problematic Rashi in parshat Shlach who says that the eight threads of tsitsit represent the eight days from the exodus until the Shirat Hayam. Surely there were only seven days! If we use a 'day then night' time scheme, there are eight days from the exodus – which was in the night of the 10th plague when they were given permission to leave [even though they only actually left in the morning] – until they sang the Shirah on the morning after krait yam suf. See Ramban [Shmot 12.39] and Rabbi Yitschak Abarbanel on the Hagaddah [Rabban Gamliel says] for a different approach regarding our original question.

## 15 Questions for the Chag of Pesach (See answers on page 4)

1. A day in Nissan we say full, they say  $\frac{1}{2}$ .
2. A day in Nissan we say  $\frac{1}{2}$ , they say none.
3. 2 days in Nissan we all say  $\frac{1}{2}$ .
4. Some people say 14 הלל times in חודש ניסן. True or false?
5. Outside Eretz Yisrael we repeat many מצות for a second day. Which מצות do we not repeat?
6. Which מצות do we finish 17 [halachic] hours after we start it?
7. What restrictions apply for 7  $\frac{1}{2}$  days [מן התורה]?
8. The phrase וחורבו שלופה בידו comes in the הגדה, but also somewhere else on 1st day פסח. Where?
9. I am a measurement on everyone's lips starting from 2nd סדר. What am I?
10. Why doesn't the מחזור give the divisions for Kriat Hatorah for שבת [with 7 not 5 עליות] on the 2nd day of פסח as it does on the 1st day?
11. Where on the 2nd day do we hear about a man undoing the wicked work of his grandfather?
12. Three ways in which the weekday שמנה עשרה

of שמנה עשרה is different from the weekday שמנה עשרה we said on ערב פסח.

13. When this year do we read all about יום כיפור on פסח?
14. Which 20 פסוקים from the תורה are said twice on one of the days of פסח, and also on one other occasion?
15. Two cases of a restriction on eating certain food which finishes one day earlier for people in Eretz Yisrael than for people outside Israel.





## Raising Even the Mundane *By Rabbi Shmuel Oppenheimer*

One of the 'four sons' mentioned in the Haggadah is the 'Wicked son'. He asks "Ma Ho'avodah Hazot Lachem" - "What is this service to you" and the Haggadah tells us what to do with him - to knock his teeth out and tell him "It is on account of this that Hashem did for me when I left Egypt", the Haggadah tells us 'for me and not him: if he would have been there he would have not been redeemed'.

The simple question which begs an answer is: Why is the Haggadah changing from the answer given in the Torah, which is, "You shall say, it is a Pesach feast-offering to Hashem, who skipped over the houses of the children of Israel in Egypt when he smote the Egyptians, but he saved our households".

I heard my Rosh Yeshiva, Rav Tzvi Kushelevsky shlit"a explain it in the following way: Firstly, the word Lachem which we translated above to mean 'to you' can also mean 'for you'. It can be 'to you' as opposed to someone else, yet it can also mean 'for you', as we find in the Gemarah Pesachim (regarding how the day of Yom Tov should be used) "Half for you and half for Hashem".

Another important point is that this 'wicked son' here isn't a simple unlearned man. In order to be a real heretic one really needs to know it all and nevertheless be a heretic. A man once came over to a famous Maskil (reformer) and told him "I am a heretic like you". The Maskil responded by asking him many questions from Talmud and Chumash, to see how much this man actually knew. Seeing how little the man knew he told him, "You are not a heretic, your just simply an unlearned man!". A heretic isn't simply an unlearned man: it is someone who has learnt but nevertheless denies.

And so, the 'wicked son' is asking a deep question. By saying Lachem, besides excluding himself, he is also

alluding to the fact that the entire purpose for the Korban Pesach is to eat it. We see this from various Halachic differences between this Korban and other Korbanot. He is thus asking: Really you seek the mundane pleasures of this world. However, you wish to cloak these pleasures with the purpose of a Mitzvah. Your service is really just Lachem - for you. Real service, he challenges, is offering up solely for Hashem and not for you to enjoy. And at the same time he is excluding himself, by choosing the word Lachem which also means 'to you'.

The Haggadah deals with him by saying knock out his teeth because he excluded himself. However, the actual deeper question which he asked, we need an answer for ourselves, but we don't need to answer him. This is because his question wasn't really a question, it was in fact an answer to himself, to answer up his ways, for even if we were to give him a legitimate response, he wouldn't change. This is a famous principle derived from a story with Reb Chaim Soloveitchik zt"l. He was learning with a group of talmidim and a Maskil came in and asked a question, which Rav Chaim ignored. After the Maskil left, Rav Chaim's talmidim asked him why he didn't answer him. Rav Chaim said that he had an answer; however, that man wasn't asking a question, he was saying an answer, to answer his own crooked ways. "For questions there are answers, but for answers there is no answer!"

Therefore, the Torah tells us the real answer to his deeper question - "You shall say, it is a Pesach feast-offering to Hashem". The Torah is emphasizing that we are offering up for Hashem, and even its consumption is for the sake of Heaven. Others say that in order to become holy, one must live a life of abstinence. As Jews we take even the mundane and raise it for the sake of Heaven.

*Pesach Kasher V'Sameach.*



## Songs for the Soul *By Rabbi Yossi Brysh*

The Gemara in Megillah (10b) tells us that on the night of Kriat Yam Suf, the malachim in heaven wanted to start singing shira. Their attempt was refused by Hashem and he rebuked them harshly - "My creations are drowning in the sea and you want to sing?!" However, just moments later, Bnei Yisrael upon witnessing the utter destruction of the Egyptian empire burst out in joyous song, as we say every day - Moshe uvenai Yisrael lecha anu shira besimcha rabba. Further, not only do they sing their thanks to Hashem, but they go into every intricate detail of just how He demolished the Egyptian army in the sea. What is going on here? Why does Hashem tell the malachim not to sing, but then allows Bnei Yisrael to sing not just any song, but one that every generation will sing every day for the rest of time?

Rabbi Avigdor Miller zt"l answers that there is a fundamental difference between malachim and

humans. Malachim, in a spiritual sense, are static - they are incapable of growth. Humans, on the other hand, are spiritually mobile - we can grow spiritually or we can fall. The purpose of shira is to stir up feelings of gratitude towards our Creator, and through that, grow closer to Him. Since malachim are devoid of this ability, their song is without purpose. This is what angered Hashem - "I've had to destroy My creations, and you want to sing a song that accomplishes nothing?!" When we sing though, it's an entirely different story. Our song elevates us and brings us nearer to Hashem; it lifts us to a higher level. This type of song is what Hashem wants to hear: He sees we are taking the opportunity to draw close to Him.

May we merit to use our power of shira to raise ourselves in kedusha, and may we very soon sing the ultimate song with the coming of Mashiach bimhera beyameinu amen.





## Eruv Tavshilin – How far does it go? *By Rabbi Namir Cohen*

On a Biblical level one may cook on Yom Tov for Shabbat. Our holy Rabbis decreed however, that one must make an eruv tavshilin in order to do so. The question is: Does the eruv tavshilin help to allow any melacha from Yom Tov to Shabbat or are some things still forbidden? Furthermore, do some things not even need it in order to be performed?

Ran says that it only helps for preparations pertaining to the Shabbat meals. Haga'ot Ashri argues and holds it works for everything. The third opinion is that of Maran in Shulchan Aruch (OC 527:19) that only preparations pertaining to the Shabbat meals need eruv tavshilin but all other melachot are permitted without it. Thus, one may light the Shabbat candles even without eruv tavshilin.

Moram (Remo) in OC 528:2 writes that one may not make eruv chatzeirot on Yom Tov going into Shabbat even if one made eruv tavshilin. There are two opinions as to why. The Magen Avraham's reason is because we hold like the aforementioned Ran. (The Hoga'ot Ashri of course would allow this). Reb Akiva Eiger says that one can only make eruv tavshilin for preparing something that could be used for Yom Tov; since an eruv chatzeirot cannot be made on Yom Tov for Yom Tov itself, eruv tavshilin does not allow it to be made for Shabbat.

It follows that a practical difference which would come out from the above opinions would be whether one could roll a sefer Torah on Yom Tov for Shabbat (e.g. this year to roll from Beshalach on 7th day to Parshat Re'eh). Another difference would be carrying a siddur on Yom Tov for Shabbat in a place where one can't carry on Shabbat.

However, one may add that Reb Akiva Eiger in OC 302 writes that actions which don't involve an actual melacha but rather are considered mere hachana (preparation) don't need eruv tavshilin e.g. making beds, tidying a room. And so according to Reb Akiva Eiger there are three levels.

1) Things which cannot be done for Yom Tov eruv tavshilin doesn't help for. 2) General Melachot need eruv tavshilin. 3) Hachanot don't need eruv tavshilin.

Cheshev Ha'eiphod says that to carry a siddur or tallit and certainly to roll a sefer Torah would be permitted because of the following reasons: firstly, we have Reb Akiva Eiger who would allow these things which can technically be done for Yom Tov itself. Secondly we have Maran who holds anything which isn't food preparation doesn't even need eruv tavshilin. And thirdly we have the Haga'ot Ashri that eruv tavshilin works for anything, even eruv chatzeirot. (However for a final ruling, one should consult Rabbinical authorities).

## Don't Just Pass Over *By Rabbi Mo'ishie Wieder*



In this article, I would like to share with you a powerful idea written in the beautiful Haggadah of Rav Mandlebaum shlita, a well-known thinker and author, who I had the zechut to learn from during my years in Eretz Yisrael.

The question is asked: What is unique about the mitzvah of Sippur Yetziat Mitzraim- the telling of all the wonders Hashem performed for us as we left Egypt- if either way we have a mitzvah every day of Zechira- remembering the fact that we were taken out of Mitzraim? The Netziv answers with the following parable: A father sees his son engaged in an activity which could be detrimental to his health. The father uses the opportunity to tell his son about all the dangers of the activity, as well as the benefits gained from restraint. Using parables and stories to bring home the message, the son is stirred to change his ways. Days later, to ensure that the message hasn't been forgotten, the father reminds his son- "Remember the hours we spent together discussing that topic!". That is all that is needed for the son to reconnect to the emotions he felt at the time of the lengthy conversation. So too, says the Netziv, Seder Night is the source of our inspiration over our redemption from Egypt, and it is the source we reconnect to throughout the year; as if we say twice a day to ourselves "remember Seder Night and the inspiration we felt" during the latter section of Kriat Shema. Now we can understand why the Rambam only mentions Sippur Yetziat Mitzraim- the mitzvah of Seder Night- in his counting of the mitzvot, as he understood that this is the source for the remembrance throughout the year!

Now that we understand a little more about the purpose of telling over the wonders of Yetziat Mitzraim and the bearing the Seder Night has on the entire year, let's look at the inspiration available to us on these wondrous nights. The Sefer HaChinuch explains (Mitzvah 21) that the inspiration of Yetziat Mitzraim is relevant to every one of us, not only in relating the greatest episode of our illustrious history, but to our everyday lives. How? We see from the events in Egypt how Hashem is the true power; how He controls every aspect of Creation, and that there is no matter in this world which escapes His all-encompassing Hashgacha, then and now and forever. Furthermore, the Mitzvot of Matzah, Marror and the Four Cups enable us to use physical actions to absorb the messages buried within, "touching base" with all the senses in moving ourselves with this powerful message. In this way, Pesach is the time where we meditate on the ultimate Truth and use that power to anchor us and the light to spread into the year ahead.

*Chag Kasher VeSameach!*



## Sefirat HaOmer Nowadays *By Rabbi Meyer Rabinowitz*

Sefirat Haomer during the time of the Beit Hamikdash was a Torah mitzvah, as the well-known pesukim say. Whether nowadays it is still a Torah or Rabbinical mitzvah is disputed by the Rishonim, based on whether the connection to the Omer Korban is an intrinsic part of the mitzvah of counting or just a starting date.

This dispute stems from the understanding of the Gemara in סו where Abaye requires us to count the weeks and the days; the Rabbis of Rav Ashi's yeshiva counted both days and weeks, whilst Amemar only counted the days, explaining that nowadays it is a זכר למקדש. The כסף משנה explains that the dispute about the status of the mitzvah nowadays is whether counting days and weeks as we do means that we hold it is a Torah mitzvah, or whether Rav Ashi's yeshiva – who counted days and weeks as we do – also accepted the concept of זכר למקדש.

This question has ramifications for various Halachic questions which arise about sefirah, as we shall see.

Do you have to wait until night to count, or can you count during twilight, or may there even be preference for counting during twilight? The מחבר says that people who are careful about their mitzvah performance will count at night. This implies that the main view in his opinion is that one can count during twilight, which fits with the view that nowadays sefira is Rabbinical, making counting at twilight

א ספק דרבנן. Tosafot in Menachot and Rosh in Pesachim hold that the requirement of תמימות makes it better to count before night; the ר"ן disagrees and holds that one should not get into a ספק דרבנן for the sake of תמימות.

If you are eating, do you have to stop to count the Omer? The רמ"א writes that you do, and the משנה ברורה writes that this fits with the view that the Omer counting is a Torah mitzvah; whereas if it were a Rabbinical mitzvah, one would not have to stop to count, although he refers to those who suggest that even if it were a Rabbinical mitzvah, one might be required to interrupt the meal as counting takes very little time.

If you cannot remember whether or not you have counted, if it is a Torah mitzvah, you would have to count now, not so if it is Rabbinical.

There seems to be a contradiction between conducting the second seder and counting the Omer, as the Omer only starts the day after Yom Tov. A similar contradiction exists regarding eating in the Succah on Shmini Atseret, where catering for the 2nd day of Yom Tov outside the land of Israel requires eating in the succah, but Shmini Atseret is no longer a time for succah. The way this inconsistency is dealt with differs in both places: on Succot no bracha is made on the succah in order to minimize the contradiction. On Pesach we remain with the full-blown contradiction, and we count and with a bracha as well as conducting the seder. Why this difference? One answer is advanced by proponents of the view that counting nowadays is a Torah mitzvah: we cannot allow a Torah-mandated counting to give way to the requirements of Yom Tov Sheni. On Shmini Atseret it is the other way round: the succah is the result of Yom Tov Sheni, so it gives way to the actual 'real' Yom Tov of Shmini Atseret.

## Answers to 15 Questions for the Chag of Pesach

1. פסח 2nd Day on הלל
2. פסח 8th Day on הלל
3. ראש חודש אייר and ראש חודש ניסן on הלל
4. True: Those in חוץ לארץ who say הלל in shul on סדר nights and the actual סדר plus 8 days and יום טוב and ראש חודש אייר 1st day and ניסן.
5. ביעור חמץ, ספירת העומר
6. ביעור חמץ
7. The restrictions on not eating, getting benefit from, owning חמץ.
8. In the הפטרה referring to the 'man' who appeared to יהושע.
9. עומר.
10. 2nd day never falls on שבת.
11. uprooted the עבודה זרה המלך יאשיהו of his grandfather מנשה.
12. מוריד הטל 1] The summer version of ברכת השנים 3] יעלה ויבא
13. At שבת as the next שבת on מנחה is פרשת אחרי מות.
14. The שירה is said in פסוקי דזמרה and as Kriat Hatorah on 7th day. Same on פרשת בשלח.
15. A] Chametz. B] Chadash - grain planted during the year which becomes permitted for people in Eretz Yisrael at the end of the 1st day of the Omer – nightfall of the 17th of Nissan. For people outside Eretz Yisrael it becomes permitted on the nightfall of the 18th of Nissan.

